

DELEGATED OFFICER REPORT

Application Ref: H/24/97628

Site Address: 14 WINCHESTER STREET, BOTLEY, SOUTHAMPTON, SO30 2AA

Case Officer: Claire Campbell-Best

Description: Rear dormer and loft conversion.

Particular Site Constraints	Yes ☒	No ☐
Within the Urban Edge Within the Botley Conservation Area (Zone 4) Adjacent to a Grade II Listed Building – 7 Winchester Street Tree Preservation Order – 97-E Southern Water Sewers 2m Buffer – Foul Sewer		

Planning History	Yes ☒	No ☐
Reference No	Description	Decision
H/21/92055	Two and single storey rear extension	Permit – 08/06/2021
C/14/74533 14 and 16 Winchester Street	Retention of replacement box sash windows with double glazed sash windows	Permit – 10/11/2014

Publicity:	Letters ☒	Site Notice ☒	Newspaper ☒
Representations:	None received		
Botley Parish Council:	<u>No objection</u> No comments or observations		
Built Heritage Consultant:	<u>Objection</u> Context This southern part of Winchester Street is within the original Botley Conservation Area first designated in May 1975, extended in October 1988 and reviewed in 2016/17. The house opposite known as Winchester House is listed Grade II, as are three others on the west side of the street together with no 8 on the east side next but one to the south. In the 2017 review, just being updated before going to committee, Winchester Street from The Square up to no 41 but not including the fire station is in zone 4 and this house which is semi-detached with no.16 to the north and no.10 The Brewery Bar to the south are all highlighted as unlisted buildings that make a positive contribution to the area. Not only is it in the Conservation Area but the southern flank of no.14 is completely exposed to the open car park of the pub and Winchester Street, so the way the building is extended will be on view to everybody moving north along Winchester Street, in particular those walking, therefore affecting the setting of the heritage asset Winchester House opposite in particular. A one and two storey extension was added to the rear following an application in 2021 with the two-storey element having a basic flat roof. I objected to this at the time saying - This will not look very clever, a basic flat roof in this position is just not acceptable. A hipped slate roof to match the existing is needed at the southern end of the extension at least to preserve the quality of building in this locale. The		

	application was revised then a subsequent minor amendment was allowed to revert to the flat roof, of which I was not aware. The Proposal. The current proposal is to add an even more brutal flat roofed box to the roof, which contrary to the agent's claim, will be visible from the street at the southern end. The main tenet of development control in a conservation area is that it should preserve or enhance the Boroughs heritage assets which include conservation areas. This does precisely the opposite. This building already has box extensions at ground and first floor level to the rear, an even more brutal one on the roof will affect a far wider area of the conservation area and compromise the quality of the conservation area and the setting of a listed building. Conclusion. The design of this proposal is not of good enough quality for inside the conservation area and within the setting of a listed building. Object.
Ecology:	No objection
Trees:	No objection
Southern Water Services:	No objection – guidance notes provided

Site Visit:	Yes ☒	No ☐
Details: Site visit carried out 16/07/2024 – Photographs on file		

Legislation:
Section 38(6) of the Planning Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 states:- <i>"If regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the planning acts the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise."</i> The site also lies within a Conservation Area and Section 72(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Area) Act 1990 states:- <i>"In the exercise, with respect to any buildings or other land in the Conservation Area of any powers (under Planning Acts), special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing."</i>
Policy:
National Planning Policy Framework Planning Practice Guidance Development Plan: The <u>Eastleigh Borough Local Plan 2016-2036</u> The most relevant policies are Strategic policies S1 and S2; and Development Management policies DM1, DM2, DM11, DM12 and DM14. Supplementary Planning Documents: Quality Places; Residential Parking Standards; Botley Conservation Area (Zone 4)

Assessment:
<u>Site and Surroundings</u> The application relates to one half of a two storey semi-detached property located on the southeastern side of Winchester Street. The property is a late Victorian construction with red facing brickwork and is traditional in appearance with the flank elevation exposed to the open car park of the pub (The Brewery Bar) to the south and the southern end of Winchester Street. Planning permission was granted under H/21/92055 for a flat roofed two and single storey rear extension which is now complete. The site falls within the

Botley Conservation Area; 7 Winchester Street is opposite to the property and is a listed building. Further listed buildings are to the south, northwest and southwest of the site.

Proposal

This application seeks permission for a loft conversion; this would include the construction of a rear box dormer to the eastern roof slope. This would measure approximately 2.3m in height, 5m in width and 3.3m in depth and would be finished in hung tiles to match the colour and appearance of the existing roof. The loft conversion would accommodate a bedroom and an ensuite, with a window serving each room.

Principle

The application site falls within the urban edge, whereby alterations or extensions to, or within the curtilage of residential dwellinghouses are considered to be acceptable in principle, however would be subject to the following considerations listed in the report below.

The application site also falls within Zone 4 of the Botley Conservation Area. Therefore triggering Section 72 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended), which requires the local planning authority, or as the case may be, the Secretary of State, pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a Conservation Area.

In addition to the site being situated in a Conservation Area, the site is covered by Policy DM12. This policy seeks to ensure any proposed development makes a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness. Particular attention should be paid to the details of design to ensure that the character of these areas is as a minimum sustained, and where possible enhanced.

Character and Appearance

14 Winchester Street is situated within the Botley Conservation Area, with a listed building adjacent to the property as well as listed properties within the local vicinity; all of which make a positive contribution to the Conservation Area. The principal elevation to the property is also considered to contribute positively to the Conservation Area due to its traditional appearance. To the rear, a two and single storey extension has recently been constructed; these additions are flat roofed and are somewhat discordant with the host property and its traditional character and are visible within the Winchester Street streetscene.

The introduction of a rear box dormer would further contribute to the staggered built form to the rear right up to the roofline, exacerbating the bulkiness to the rear elevation. Furthermore, the dormer would dominate the roof slope, the windows do not align with the existing rear elevation windows and is considered to be of poor design that does not relate well to the host dwelling.

When considering the wider Conservation Area, the proposal would be visible from the southern end of Winchester Street and from the public house car park. The Built Heritage Consultant was consulted, and they placed an objection, noting that the proposal does not preserve or enhance the Conservation Area, as it compromises the quality of the Conservation Area and the setting of the nearby listed building, 7 Winchester Street.

Therefore, given the above considerations, the application will be recommended for refusal due to its design, impact on the streetscene and the wider Conservation Area.

Residential Amenity

The proposed dormer would result in two windows which would mainly face the rear garden to the site with views into the neighbouring garden at Honeysuckle Cottage to the

north of the site and an oblique view into the garden area of The Brewery Bar to the southeast. One of the windows would serve an ensuite and would likely be obscured glazed, preventing overlooking; the other window would serve a bedroom. While it is acknowledged this second floor window would overlook the above areas as described, this is no more harmful than the existing views from the first floor rear windows and unavoidable in an urban setting. It is therefore considered that the proposal would not adversely harm the nearby neighbouring amenity.

In summary, the proposed development accords with guidance set out in the 'Quality Places' SPD in that there will be no unacceptable impact on the amenity of the neighbouring properties in terms of loss of privacy, light or outlook.

Highways Safety and Parking

The proposal would increase the bedrooms to the property from four to five, this would not however increase the number of required off-street parking provision (three parking spaces). Therefore, the current parking arrangements to the driveway and garage as indicated on the proposed site plan would have been considered to be appropriate had the proposed development been acceptable in terms of design.

Ecology and Trees

The Council's Ecologist was consulted due to the proposed works to the roof, the previous approved planning application was accompanied with a preliminary ecological appraisal which assessed the building as having negligible potential for roosting bats. The Ecologist confirmed they were satisfied the property did not have bat roost features. Biodiversity enhancements would have been advised to the applicant by way of informative had the application been recommended for approval.

There is a protected tree to the south of the property, the Council's Tree Officer was consulted and they confirmed due to the nature of the proposal (at roof level) the protected tree was unlikely to be impacted upon and placed no objection.

Climate Change:

In July 2019, the Council declared a Climate Change and Environmental Emergency. In doing so it agreed, among other things, to: (a) put in place measures to ensure the Council's own operations and functions achieve carbon neutrality by 2025; (b) work with partners to aim for all projects and services delivered in the Borough to achieve carbon neutrality by 2030; (c) ensure that the Council's procurement policy recognises carbon neutrality as one of its primary considerations; and (d) recognise the urgency of action to mitigate and adapt to climate change in every decision taken by the Council. This is underpinned by the Climate and Environment Emergency Strategy 2020–2030 and the supporting Climate and Environmental Emergency Action Plan – Update June 2020.

The declaration of the Climate Change and Environmental Emergency demonstrates a strong commitment from the Council to achieve net zero. The NPPF, development plan and adopted local plan policy do not set this as a specific target, but it is a material consideration to be considered alongside all other material considerations. In any case addressing climate change is a core part of the NPPF and local plan policy. The need to support the economy is part of the Strategic Environmental Assessment for the adopted local plan, as is an assessment of climate impacts.

The NPPF aims for the need for housing to be met, and policy S2 of the Local Plan sets a target for 14,580 dwellings to be provided by 2036. The NPPF, Policies S1, DM2 and DM3 of the Local Plan and energy and water elements of the adopted Environmentally Sustainable Development SPD require development to be sustainable in terms of resource use, climate change and energy use. When considering the impact of climate change, the proposed development is expected to be resilient to the potential effects of climate change and is expected to reduce/limit impacts on climate emissions as a result of the development or its use.

Equalities Implications:

Section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010 created the public sector equality duty. Section 149 states:

- A public authority must, in the exercise of its functions, have due regard to the need to:
 - a. eliminate discrimination, harassment, victimisation and any other conduct that is prohibited by or under this Act;
 - b. advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it;
 - c. foster good relations between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it.

When making policy decisions, the Council must take account of the equality duty and in particular any potential impact on protected groups. It is considered that this application does not raise any equality implications

Conclusion: This application is recommended for refusal:

Reasons for refusal:

- 1) The proposed dormer window by reason of its siting, scale and poor fenestration alignment, would result in an unattractive and incongruous feature which would visually dominate the roof slope of the dwelling and cause the property to gain an undue level of prominence in the street scene and surrounding area. As such the proposed development would be detrimental to the character and appearance of the Botley Conservation Area and harmful to the setting of the nearby listed building, No.7 Winchester Street, and is contrary to Policies DM1 and DM12 of the Eastleigh Borough Local [2016-2036] and The Quality Places Supplementary Planning Document (2011).

Recommendation:

PERMIT ☐

REFUSE ☒